

Mario Di Fiorino*, Gabriele Massimetti **, Massimo Nencioni*, Riccardo A. Paoli*

**Psychiatric Department Versilia, Italy; **University of Pisa, Italy*

Марио Ди Фиорино, Габриэль Массиметти, Массимо Ненчиони, Рикардо А. Паоли

Full and subthreshold Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder seven years after a flooding in rescue squads¹

Полное и частичное Посттравматическое Стрессовое Расстройство спустя семь лет после участия в командах по спасению жертв наводнения

Summary. Aims: In this study, we decided to evaluate after 7 years the frequency and severity of PTSD on ambulance personnel employed in assistance operation of 1996 Cardoso's flood. **Methods:** The ambulance personnel sample was formed by 34 subjects. The Clinician-Administered PTSD Scale for DSM-IV and the Davidson Trauma Scale were used for assessing diagnosis and PTSD symptoms, respectively. **Results:** In lifetime period, 52,9% (N=18) of patients, had full PTSD, 14,7% (N=5) subthreshold PTSD with impairment, 14,7% (N=5) subthreshold PTSD without impairment, and 17,7% (N=6) had no PTSD. In current period, 11,8% (N=4) of patients, had full PTSD, 11,8% (N=4) subthreshold PTSD with impairment, 17,6% (N=6) subthreshold PTSD without impairment, and 58,8% (N=20) no PTSD; 1 patient (female) had delayed onset full PTSD after 1 year, 1 (female) had delayed onset subthreshold PTSD with impairment after 2 year, and 2 patients (both males) had delayed onset subthreshold PTSD without impairment after 2 years. Furthermore, scores on DTS show that not only full PTSD, but even the subthreshold form is associated with scores significantly higher than no PTSD ($p < .05$). **Discussion:** This study shows the persistence of a level of PTSD morbidity 7 years after the event, suggesting that even in emergency workers the psychosocial impact of the event is not time-limited, emphasizing the need for preventive interventions, both immediately after the catastrophic event and in the long term. Moreover, also for emergency workers is confirmed the concept that dichotomizing people into those with and without PTSD following DSM-IV criteria represents a simplification that obscures the clinical problems and needs of those with some, but not full, symptom criteria of PTSD.

Резюме. Цели: В этом исследовании мы решили оценить частоту и выраженность Посттравматического Стрессового Расстройства (ПТСР) у персонала службы неотложной помощи, задействованных при оказании помощи жертвам наводнения 1996 года в Кардозо, спустя 7 лет после этого события. **Методы:** выборка персонала неотложной помощи состояла из 34 человек. Для выявления ПТСР и регистрации его симптомов применялись диагностическая шкала DSM-IV для выявления ПТСР и Шкала Травмы Дэвидсона (ШТД). **Результаты:** В течении жизни 52,9 % (N=18) пациентов страдали от полного ПТСР, 14,7 % (N=5) - частичного ПТСР со значимым нарушением функционирования, 14,7 % (N=5) - частичного ПТСР без значимого нарушения функционирования, и 17,7 % (N=6) - не имели ПТСР. В момент обследования 11,8 % (N=4) пациентов имели полное ПТСР, 11,8 % (N=4) - частичное ПТСР со значимым нарушением функционирования, 17,6 % (N=6) - частичный ПТСР без значимого нарушения функционирования, и 58,8 % (N=20) не имели ПТСР; одна пациентка имела отсроченное начало полного ПТСР спустя год, одна пациентка имела отсроченное начало частичного ПТСР со значимым нарушением функционирования спустя 2 года после происшествия, и 2 пациента имели частичное ПТСР без значимого нарушения функционирования спустя 2 года. Кроме того, ШТД показала, что не только полное ПТСР, но и даже частичная форма связана с показателями значительно более высокими, чем отсутствие ПТСР ($p < .05$). **Обсуждение:** Это исследование показывает постоянство уровня заболеваемости ПТСР спустя 7 лет после происшествия. Это позволяет предположить, что даже среди работников служб спасения психосоциальное воздействие трагедии не ограничено временем, что подчеркивает потребность в профилактических вмешательствах, и немедленно после катастрофического случая и в долгосрочной перспективе. Кроме того, и для работников служб спасения подтверждена концепция, что простое разделение людей как имеющих и не имеющих ПТСР следуя критериям DSM-IV является упрощением, которое затеняет клинические проблемы и нужды тех пациентов, которые не соответствуют полностью критериям ПТСР.

¹ Paper presented at the conference "Trauma and Recovery" in Yerevan, Armenia, October, 2003.

Introduction

The psychological consequences of natural disasters have been investigated extensively in recent years (Maj et al., 1989; Rubonis et al., 1991; Freddy et al., 1992; Lima et al., 1993; Goenjian et al., 1994; Bland et al., 1996; Sharan et al., 1996; Bland et al., 1997; Carr et al., 1997; McFarlan et al., 1997; Armenian et al., 2000). Studies using standardized diagnostic criteria have reported a prevalence rate of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) of 10-30% in population exposed to a natural disaster (Armenian et al., 2000; Madakasira & O'Brien, 1987; Steinglass & Gerrity, 1990; Lima et al., 1991; Green et al., 1992; Garrison et al., 1995; Wang et al., 2000), substantially higher than that observed in the general population (1-8%) (Davidson et al., 1991; Resnick et al., 1993; Kessler et al., 1995; Solomon & Davidson, 1997; Perkonig et al., 2000).

Over the past two decades, there has been increased awareness of consequences of exposure to tragic and gruesome events in emergency-service work and the potential for traumatic stress symptoms. A study of firefighters (Bryant et al., 1996) reported high rates of significant distress, or severe distress, of 26% measured with the IES (Impact of Event Scale; Horowitz et al., 1979). Emergency responders reported symptoms that included recurrent dreams, feelings of detachment, dissociation, anger, irritability, or depression, memory or concentration impairment; somatic disturbances; and alcohol and substances use (Alexander et al., 2001; Bryant et al., 1996; Gersons et al., 1989; Solomon et al., 1986). Two empirical investigations of emergency services personnel responding to the 1989 Loma Prieta earthquake (Marmar et al., 1996; Weiss et al., 1995) suggested that approximately 9% of the workers showed psychiatric symptoms at the level of those of an outpatient population. Ambulance service workers in particular were found responding to more emergency calls than the police and fire service combined (James & Wright, 1991) and may suffer greater psychological distress than these other groups (Marmar et al., 1996). 30% of ambulance personnel in Scotland (Alexander et al., 2001) reported symptoms in the high range of the Impact of Event Scale (IES). Thompson & Suzuki (1991) studied 40 experienced ambulance workers selected randomly from the London Ambulance Service, using the Impact of Event Scale (IES). Their sample scored high on the intrusion scale of the IES and 60% showed signs of 'probable psychological distress' as detected by the GHQ (General Health Questionnaire; Goldberg, 1972). Emergency workers are furthermore at risk of developing post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). Studies of emergency staff responding to disasters report prevalence rates of between 10% and 17% (Anderson et al., 1991; Durham et al., 1985; McCammon et al., 1988). A study of body handlers (Ursano et al., 1995) found that 11% had PTSD 3 months after their disaster work. Troops deployed in op-

eration Desert Storm who performed graves registration duties had increased posttraumatic stress symptoms (McCarrol et al., 1993; Sutker et al., 1994a,b); nearly one-half had current PTSD (Sutker et al., 1994b). Rentoul & Ravenscroft (1993) also studied the London Ambulance Service and found that 15% of frontline staff could be given a full diagnosis of PTSD.

Despite these findings, emergency personnel have not been investigated as extensively as the 'primary victims' in natural disasters (Taylor & Frazer, 1982). A stereotype of victims as 'helpless and resourceless' and helpers as 'strong and resourceful' (Short 1979, cited in Shepherd & Hodgkinson, 1990) may be partly responsible for this lack of research.

Emergency responders also experience PTSD symptoms that often extend beyond the acute-crisis phase and become chronic in nature (Marmar et al., 1999; McFarlane, 1988a). Disaster workers in fact are at risk of both acute and chronic PTSD (McFarlane, 1988b). However, emergency workers, have not been studied as much as primary victims regarding PTSD outcome. In a study of civilian survivors of traumatic events in Israel, 39% had diagnosable PTSD 1 month following trauma, 17% PTSD 4 months after trauma and only 10% had PTSD 1 year following trauma (Shalev et al., 1997; Freedmen et al., 1999). Recovery from early PTSD has been estimated, in an epidemiological study, to involve 60% of those initially expressing the disorder (Kessler et al., 1995). In the National Vietnam Veterans Readjustment Study, the difference between lifetime and current prevalence of PTSD (30% and 15.2%) suggests an overall 50% recovery or remission rate of those once diagnosed as suffering from the disorder (Kulka et al., 1990). Similar recovery rates were obtained in prospective studies (Dunitz, 2000).

Moreover, the DSM-IV identifies delayed onset PTSD when the condition develops at least 6 months after the traumatic event. There are case studies of delayed onset PTSD developing as long as 30 years after the alleged precipitating event (van Dyke et al., 1985). In terms of the frequency of this form of PTSD, delayed onset appears to be a rarely diagnosed condition. Large scale studies of civilian trauma have reported delayed onset PTSD in a very small minority of cases (range: 4.4%-6.2%, Buckley et al., 1996; Ehlers et al., 1998; Mayou et al., 1993). The rarity of this condition has made empirical study of delayed onset PTSD difficult to conduct.

Finally, may be interesting to consider the subthreshold form of PTSD. In fact Stein et al. (1997) found subthreshold PTSD with impairment to be prevalent in 2-3% of the normal population at a chronically significant level. Davidson (2002) found in a sample of 630 subjects from normal population, that 26 (4.1%) fulfilled criteria of subthreshold PTSD with impairment and 78 (12.4%) of subthreshold PTSD without impairment. He found no significant differences between full and subthreshold with impairment PTSD, but, above all, noti-

ced significant differences between both form and no PTSD. Thus, dichotomizing people into those with and without PTSD following DSM-IV criteria might be a simplification that obscures the clinical problems and needs of those with some, but not full, symptom criteria of PTSD.

Aim of the study

Due to its hydrogeological characteristics, Italy is one of the European countries at higher risk of natural disasters. In fact in past years, different areas of the country have been hit by earthquakes and landslides which have brought about material and human losses. However, the psychological consequences of these events have received scant attention and, just a few studies have been carried out in this research field (Catapano et al., 2001; Mantero et al., 2001; Maj et al., 1989). Moreover, no one implied rescue workers. In Sarno landslide (Catapano et al., 2001), 12 months after the event, 27 % of the subjects interviewed and 1,4% of controls met the DSM-IV criteria for PTSD, identifying high levels of PTSD symptomatology 1 year after the disaster. The percentage of subjects identified in Sarno was consistent with that reported in other studies on populations exposed to natural disasters (Shore et al., 1986; Freddy et al., 1992; Bland et al., 1996; Armenian et al., 2000; Madakasira & O'Brien, 1987; Steinglass & Gerrity, 1990; Lima et al., 1991; Green et al., 1992; Garrison et al., 1995; Wang et al., 2000).

Cardoso is a little village of 450 inhabitants among the mountains Apuan Alps, at 265 m of height, about 100 km from Florence, in the Centre of Italy. It is encircled by a mountain range, whose highest peak is Mount Pania (1859 m of height). Due to its geomorphological characteristics, Cardoso is exposed to floods, mainly occurring after long periods of heavy rains. In June 1996 Central Italy, and in particular Tuscany region, was hit by heavy rains which gave rise to serious problems for the population. On June 16, in few hours, the bigger quantity of rain in the last 20 years concentrated in the mountains around Cardoso came down, making up a flooding which involved all the villages sited below. Most material damage and human losses were recorded in the village of Cardoso, where many houses were destroyed or damaged and 14 people died. Even other villages, lying at the foot of Cardoso, were damaged by the flood, but less seriously and without human losses. Immediately after the event, ambulance workers squads coming from both the community implied in the flood and far arrived on the scene of the disaster to give help to Cardoso's inhabitants.

7 years after the Cardoso's flood, we decided to evaluate the frequency and severity of PTSD on ambulance personnel employed in salvage operations.

Methods

Sample

The rescue workers sample, was formed by 34 subjects. Subjects provided informed consent. Demographic variables were collected via a questionnaire that covered age, gender, marital status, and education. All participants indicated that they had been exposed to the critical event of the flood; that is, physical risk to themselves, the death or injury or a threat to the physical integrity of a person.

Instruments

The Clinician-Administered PTSD Scale for DSM-IV (CAPS-Blake et al., 1990) and the Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS-Davidson et al., 1996) were used for assessing diagnosis and PTSD symptoms, respectively.

The CAPS is the structured clinical interview for DSM-IV and is divided in two parts, which evaluate current and lifetime diagnoses of PTSD. The CAPS was administered by three senior psychiatrists M.D., R.A.P., M.L..

The DTS was designed as a new self-rating scale to detect the presence, severity and frequency of symptoms that are characteristic of individuals who develop PTSD (Davidson et al., 1997) and for assessing treatment outcome. Items in this scale measure the 17 PTSD symptoms found in DSM-IV. Each of the 17 items on the DTS was scored from 0 to 4 for both frequency (0=none to 4=every day) and severity within the past week (0=not at all distressing to 4=extremely distressing). A total score is obtained by adding the frequency and severity scores for each item (range=0-136). Three subscales were defined by using this scale (Davidson et al., 1997): intrusion, avoidance-numbing, and hyper arousal. The intrusion score is calculated as the cumulative score of frequency and severity scores for five questions relating to this category, the avoidance/numbing score as the cumulative score for seven corresponding questions, and the hyper arousal score as the cumulative score for five corresponding questions (Chen et al., 2001). A score of 8.0 on any one item is considered the highest level of pathology, while a score of 0,0 means that the item is not present. Davidson reported high test-retest reliability for this scale within a 1-week period ($r=0,86$, $p<0.0001$), and its validity was shown by high correlation with other similar scales (Davidson et al., 1997). The scale is quick to administer (taking less than 10 min) and has been tested in a variety of populations, inclusive of men and women who have experienced different traumata.

Diagnoses

Following Davidson cut-off criteria (Davidson et al., 2002), we considered using the CAPS as well as the full PTSD, even the subthreshold form (divided in with and without impairment), which required the presence of at least one symptom from each DSM-IV cluster. Thus, four groups of rescue workers were generated as follows: A) threshold PTSD ($n=4$); subthreshold PTSD, - further

classified into B) with impairment (n=4); C) without impairment (n=6); and D) no PTSD (n=20).

Results

Regarding demographic characteristics, no statistical significance was found among the four diagnostic groups of rescue workers. The rescue workers sample (N=34) was $32,7 \pm 2,4$ years of age. Females were 41,2% (N=14) and males were 58,8% (N=20). 43,7% of the sample were married or living common-law, 46,9% were single, and 9,4% indicated that they were widowed or divorced. 12,2% had college or university degrees. 68,3% were primary school, and 19,5 % didn't finish first level of school. All participants were born in Italy and Caucasian in race.

As such as diagnoses performed by CAPS, in lifetime period 52,9% (N=18) of patients, had full PTSD, 14,7% (N=5) subthreshold PTSD with impairment, 14,7% (N=5) subthreshold PTSD without impairment, and 17,7% (N=6) had no PTSD. In current period, 11,8% (N=4) of patients, had full PTSD, 11,8% (N=4) subthreshold PTSD with impairment, 17,6% (N=6) subthreshold PTSD without impairment, and 58,8% (N=20) had no PTSD; 1 patient (female) had delayed onset full PTSD after 1 year, 1 (female) had delayed onset PTSD with impairment after 2 year, and 2 patients (both males) had delayed onset PTSD without impairment after 2 years (Tab. 1).

The sample was then subministered the DTS scale to evaluate current period. Because our sample was small and we could not ascertain normal distribution of original population, we decided to use non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis and Wilcoxon rank sum test (Siegel and Castellan, 1988). Mean (\pm SD) scores are also presented for descriptive purposes.

DTS mean score \pm SD for the whole sample (N=34) was $15,0 \pm 17,8$. The four diagnostic subgroups differed in their DTS score, whose rates were a) for threshold PTSD $54,5 \pm 17,8$, b) the subthreshold PTSD with impairment $27,7 \pm 3,1$, c) non-impaired subthreshold PTSD $17,3 \pm 3,7$ and d) non-PTSD $3,9 \pm 2,4$. DTS-Cluster mean scores \pm SD for the whole sample were: $4,5 \pm 6,5$ for intrusiveness, $5,6 \pm 6,6$ for avoidance-numbing, and $4,9 \pm 6,4$ for hyperarousal. The four subgroups also differed in their DTS-Cluster score. Intrusiveness scores were a) for threshold PTSD $17,7 \pm 9,0$, b) the subthreshold PTSD with impairment $9,7 \pm 2,2$, c) non-impaired subthreshold PTSD $3,7 \pm 1,8$ and d) non-PTSD $1,0 \pm 1,5$. Avoidance-numbing scores were a) for threshold PTSD $21,2 \pm 4,3$, b) the subthreshold PTSD with impairment $6,7 \pm 2,1$, c) non-impaired subthreshold PTSD $7,3 \pm 2,7$ and d) non-PTSD $1,7 \pm 1,9$. Hyperarousal scores were a) for threshold PTSD $15,5 \pm 10,8$, b) the subthreshold PTSD with impairment $11,0 \pm 2,9$, c) non-impaired subthreshold PTSD $6,3 \pm 3,4$ and d) non-PTSD $1,2 \pm 1,4$.

Data about DTS and DTS-Cluster score were then analyzed by the Kruskal-Wallis test for overall statistical significance (DTS: $\chi^2=26,5$, $df=3$, $P<.0001$; Intrusiveness: $\chi^2=20,0$ $df=3$, $P<.0001$; Avoidance-numbing: $\chi^2=21,9$ $df=3$, Hyperarousal: $\chi^2=19,6$ $df=3$, $P<.0001$). Pairwise comparison for four groups on DTS and DTS-Cluster score were undertaken by means of Wilcoxon rank sum test. There was a statistically significance between all pairs ($P<.05$), but: a) full PTSD vs. subthreshold PTSD with impairment in Intrusiveness Cluster, b) subthreshold PTSD with impairment vs. subthreshold PTSD without impairment in Avoidance-numbing Cluster, c) full PTSD vs. subthreshold PTSD with impairment and full PTSD vs. subthreshold PTSD without impairment in Hyperarousal Cluster. These results are shown in table 2 and 3. Finally, there was a statistically significance between men and women on DTS, Intrusiveness and Avoidant-numbing scores for the whole sample ($P<.05$) (table 4).

Discussion

PTSD typically has a chronic course of illness, with 53% of patients continuing to meet diagnostic criteria at 5 years (Kessler et al., 1995). About frequency of the disorder in our rescue squads, we found that current threshold PTSD is present in 11,8% of the sample. This high frequency of current PTSD, give up for a time persistency of the disorder, confirming data from other studies (Marmar et al., 1999; McFarlane, 1988a; McFarlane, 1988b; Kessler et al., 1995; Shalev et al., 1997; Freedmen et al., 1999; Kulka et al., 1990; Dunitz, 2000).

Moreover, we found an high rate of PTSD lifetime (59,9%), similarly with data obtained from other studies on 'primary victims' (Epstein et al., 1998). Regarding delayed-onset form of PTSD, we found a rate of 2,9% for both full and subthreshold without impairment PTSD. All these results are similar to other ones reported before in literature (Anderson et al., 1991; Durham et al., 1985; McCammon et al., 1988; Ursano et al., 1995; Sutker et al., 1994b; Rentoul & Ravenscroft, 1993; Buckley et al., 1996; Ehlers et al., 1998; Mayou et al., 1993).

Our data confirm furthermore Davidson's results (Davidson et al., 2002) that scores on the DTS can differentiate patients with PTSD and partial PTSD from patients with no PTSD. Infact, even the subthreshold PTSD, with or without impairment, is associated with DTS score significantly greater than no PTSD ($p<.05$).

About gender distribution, in our sample we found a statistical significance; infact on DTS, Intrusion and Avoidance-numbing total score, the rate of PTSD symptomatology related to the disaster was significantly lower ($p<.05$) in males (N=20) than in females (N=14). This is common in PTSD; infact, in the National Comorbidity Survey, 61% of men and 51% of women re-

ported experiencing at least one major trauma in their lifetime, and in most cases there were two or more events. PTSD developed in 20% of women and 8% of the men exposed to traumatic events (Kessler et al., 1995). Breslau and colleagues (1991) administered the revised version of the Diagnostic Interview Schedule to a sample of young adults enrolled in an HMO in Detroit and found that 11,3% of the women (30,7% of those exposed to a traumatic event) and 6,0% of the men (14,0% of those exposed) had a lifetime history of PTSD. Moreover, chronic PTSD, has been particularly associated with female gender, concomitant anxiety and depressive disorders, and family history of antisocial behaviour (Breslau & Davis, 1992).

The most used self-report scale for posttraumatic stress symptomatology in rescue squads is the IES (Mantero et al., 2001; Epstein et al., 1998; Jonsson et al., 2003; Robinson et al., 1997; Sloan et al., 1994; Renck et al., 2002; Gregg et al., 1995; Ursano et al., 1999). DTS using is recent; the scale has been used in all major multicenter pharmacotherapy trials known to the authors (Connor et al., 1999; Brady et al., 2003; Davidson et al., 2001a,b; Davidson et al., 2002; Meltzer-Brody et al., 2000), and for severity and frequency evaluation study of PTSD psychopathology (Wells et al., 2003; Chen et al., 2003; Miller et al., 2001; Bobes et al., 2000). The scale, contrary to IES, is associated with a numerically greater effect size and is comparable to that of structured clinical interview like SIP and CAPS (Davidson, 2002). It also address all aspects of PTSD (IES does not consider hyperarousal), can differentiate patients with PTSD and partial PTSD from patients with no PTSD in the general

population (Davidson, 2002) and provides normative population data, which can be used as a reference point for other studies that use this scale (Davidson, 2002).

A major limitation of this study is the sampling strategy. Infact, our sample reflected emergency personnel coming from the community implied in the flood, since afar emergency squads were less interested in the research. Thus, our study, could have underestimated or overestimated PTSD psychopathology, limiting generalizability of findings. A second limitation of the data was the small size of population. In particular, regarding statistical analyses, unfortunately we have a small size for PTSD (N=4 subjects) and subthreshold PTSD with impairment (N=4). At last, we couldn't do a comparison regarding both DTS scores and CAPS diagnoses with the same group 7 years before, the only comparison index being the PTSD lifetime diagnosis on the CAPS, not coincident with the baseline frequency of PTSD (Epstein, 1998).

In conclusion, as we can see from the high lifetime rate of PTSD, our data confirm the negative impact of a natural disaster on the mental health of rescue workers. Moreover, this study shows the persistence of a level of PTSD morbidity 7 years after the event, suggesting that even in rescue workers the psychosocial impact of the event is not time-limited, in some case even showing a delayed-onset. The frequency of PTSD found in rescue squads also some years after the event emphasizes the need for preventive interventions, both immediately after the catastrophic event and in the long term (Hodgkinson & Stewart, 1998).

Tables

Table 1. Diagnoses performed by CAPS

	A	B	C	D	
N	18	5	5	6	
%	52,9	14,7	14,7	17,7	
Males	8	2	5	5	LIFETIME
Females	10	3	0	1	
N	4	4	6	20	
%	11,8	11,8	17,6	58,8	
Males	1	1	2	16	CURRENT
Females	3	3	4	4	
N	1	1	2	-	
%	2,9	2,9	5,9	-	DELAY-ONSET
Males	0	0	2	-	
Females	1	1	0	-	

Notes: A= PTSD; B= PTSD subthreshold with impairment; C= PTSD subthreshold without impairment; D= no PTSD

Table 2. Scores on DTS in population groups: median and interquartile (1st, 3rd quartile scores)*

	A	B	C	D
Full sample (n = 34)	PTSD (n = 4)	PTSD subthreshold with impairment (n = 4)	PTSD subthreshold without impairment (n = 6)	No PTSD (n = 20)
7.00 (4.00, 22.50)	47.00 (43.75, 72.75)	27.50 (24.50, 30.50)	16.00 (14.00, 22.00)	4.00 (2.00, 5.50)

*Overall sample, Kruskal-Wallis test, $\chi^2 = 26.5$, $df=3$, $P<.0001$

$P<.05$, $A \tilde{=} B$, $A \tilde{=} C$, $A \tilde{=} D$, $B \tilde{=} C$, $B \tilde{=} D$, $C \tilde{=} D$.

Table 3. Scores on DTS-Clusters in population groups: median and interquartile (1st, 3rd quartile scores)*

	Full sample (n = 34)	A PTSD (n = 4)	B PTSD subthreshold with impairment (n = 4)	C PTSD subthreshold without impairment (n = 6)	D No PTSD (n = 20)
Intrusiveness	2.00 (0.00, 6.00)	20.00 (8.75, 24.50)	10.00 (7.50, 11.75)	3.00 (2.00, 6.00)	0.00 (0.00, 2.00)
Avoidance- numbing	4.00 (0.00, 8.00)	20.50 (17.50, 25.75)	6.50 (5.00, 8.75)	7.00 (5.00, 9.00)	2.00 (0.00, 3.50)
Hyperarousal	2.00 (0.00, 8.00)	14.00 (6.25, 26.25)	11.00 (8.25, 13.75)	7.00 (4.50, 8.50)	1.00 (0.00, 2.00)

*Overall Intrusiveness Cluster, Kruskal-Wallis test, $\chi^2 = 23.1$, $df=3$, $P<.0001$

$P<.05$, $A \tilde{=} C$, $A \tilde{=} D$, $B \tilde{=} C$, $B \tilde{=} D$, $C \tilde{=} D$.

*Overall Avoidance/Numbing Cluster, Kruskal-Wallis test, $\chi^2 = 24.3$, $df=3$, $P<.0001$

$P<.05$, $A \tilde{=} C$, $A \tilde{=} D$, $B \tilde{=} D$, $C \tilde{=} D$.

*Overall Iperarousal Cluster, Kruskal-Wallis test, $\chi^2 = 21.7$, $df=3$, $P<.0001$

$P<.05$, $A \tilde{=} D$, $B \tilde{=} C$, $B \tilde{=} D$, $C \tilde{=} D$.

Table 4. Differences on DTS scores between Males and Females in the Full Sample

	Scores (Mean Ranks)		Level of significance
	Males (n=20)	Females (n=14)	
DTS	14,25*	22,14*	$p<.022$
Intrusion	14,60*	21,64*	$p<.036$
Avoidance-numbing	14,20*	22,21*	$p<.019$
Hyperarousal	15,13	20,89	$p<.088$

References

- Alexander D., Klein S. (2001) Ambulance personnel and critical incidents: the impact of accident and emergency work on mental health. *Br J Psychiatry* 178, 76-81.
- Anderson H.S., Christensen A.K. & Peterson G.O. (1991). Post-traumatic stress reaction amongst rescue workers after a major rail accident. *Anxiety Research* 4, 245-251.
- Armenian H.K., Morikawa M., Melkonian A.K., Hovanesian A.P., Haroutunian N., Saigh P.A., Akiskal K., Akiskal H.S. (2000) Loss as a determinant of PTSD in a cohort of adult survivors of the 1988 earthquake in Armenia: implications for policy. *Acta Psychiatr Scand*, Jul 102, (1):58-64.
- Blake D.D., Weathers F.W., Nagy L.M., Kaloupek D.G., Gusman F.D., Charney D.S., Keane T.M. (1990) A clinician rating scale for assessing current and lifetime PTSD: the CAPS-1. *Behav Therapist* 18, 187.
- Bland S.H., O'Leary E.S., Farinano E., Jossa F., Krogh V., Violanti J.M., Trevisan M. (1997) Social network disturbances and psychological distress following earthquake evacuation. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, Mar 185(3):188-94.
- Bland S.H., O'Leary E.S., Farinano E., Jossa F., Trevisan M. (1996) Long-term psychological effects of natural disasters. *Psychosom Med*, Jan-Feb;58(1):18-24. Erratum in: *Psychosom Med*, Jul-Aug;58(4):320.
- Bobes J., Calcedo-Barba A., Garcia M., Francois M., Rico-Villademoros F., Gonzalez M.P., Bascaran M.T., Bousoño M.; por EGrupo Espanol de Trabajo para el Estudio del Trastornostres Postraumatico. (2000) [Evaluation of the psychometric properties of the Spanish version of 5 questionnaires for the evaluation of post-traumatic stress syndrome] *Actas Esp Psiquiatr*, Jul-Aug;28(4):207-18. Spanish.
- Brady K.T., Clary C.M. (2003) Affective and anxiety comorbidity in post-traumatic stress disorder treatment trials of sertraline. *Compr Psychiatry*, Sep-Oct;44(5):360-9.
- Breslau N., Davis G.C., Andreski P., Peterson E. (1991) Traumatic events and posttraumatic stress disorder in an urban population of young adults. *Arch Gen Psychiatry*, Mar;48(3):216-22.
- Breslau N., Davis G.C. (1992) Posttraumatic stress disorder in an urban population of young adults: risk factors for chronicity. *Am J Psychiatry*, May;149(5):671-5.
- Bryant R., Harvey A. (1996) Posttraumatic stress reactions in volunteer firefighters. *J Trauma Stress* 9:51-62
- Buckley T.C., Blanchard E.B., Hickling E.J. (1996) A prospective examination of delayed onset PTSD secondary to motor vehicle accidents. *J Abnorm Psychol*, Nov 105(4):617-25.
- Carr V.J., Lewin T.J., Webster R.A., Kenardy J.A. (1997) A synthesis of the findings from the Quake Impact Study: a two-year investigation of the psychosocial sequelae of the 1989 Newcastle earthquake. *Soc Psychiatry Psychiatr Epidemiol*, Apr;32(3):123-36.
- Catapano F., Malafronte R., Lepre F., Cozzolino P., Arnone R., Lorenzo E., Tartaglia G., Starace F., Magliano L., Maj M. (2001) Psychological consequences of the 1998 landslide in Sarno, Italy: a community study. *Acta Psychiatr Scand*, Dec 104(6):438-42.
- Chen C.H., Lin S.K., Tang H.S., Shen W.W., Lu M.L. (2001) The Chinese version of the Davidson Trauma Scale: a practice test for validation. *Psychiatry Clin Neurosci*, Oct;55(5):493-9.
- Chen C.H., Shen W.W., Tan H.K., Chou J.Y., Lu M.L. (2003) The validation study and application of stratum-specific likelihood ratios in the Chinese version of SPAN. *Compr Psychiatry*, Jan-Feb;44(1):78-81.
- Connor K.M., Sutherland S.M., Tupler L.A., Malik M.L., Davidson J.R. (1999) Fluoxetine in post-traumatic stress disorder. Randomised, double-blind study. *Br J Psychiatry*, Jul 175:17-22.
- Davidson J., Pearlstein T., Lonnberg P., Brady K.T., Rothbaum B., Bell J., Maddock R., Hegel M.T., Farfel G. (2001a) Efficacy of sertraline in preventing relapse of posttraumatic stress disorder: results of a 28-week double-blind, placebo-controlled study. *Am J Psychiatry*, Dec 158(12):1974-81.
- Davidson J., Rothbaum B.O., van der Kolk B.A., Sikes C.R., Farfel G.M. (2001b) Multicenter, double-blind comparison of sertraline and placebo in the treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder. *Arch Gen Psychiatry*, May 58(5):485-92.
- Davidson J.R., Book S.W., Colket J.T., Tupler L.A., Roth S., David D., Hertzberg M., Mellman T., Beckham J.C., Smith R.D., Davison R.M., Katz R., Feldman M.E. (1997). Assessment of a new self-rating scale for post-traumatic stress disorder. *Psychol Med*, Jan 27(1):153-60.
- Davidson J.R., Hughes D., Blazer D.G., George L.K. (1991) Post-traumatic stress disorder in the community: an epidemiological study. *Psychol Med*, Aug 21(3):713-21.
- Davidson J.R., Tharwani H.M., Connor K.M. (2002) Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS): normative scores in the general population and effect sizes in placebo-controlled SSRI trials. *Depress Anxiety*, 15(2):75-8.
- Davidson J.R.T. (1996) Davidson Trauma Scale. Multi-Health Systems, Inc.
- Dunitz M. (2000) The course of PTSD. In : *Post Traumatic Stress Disorder. Diagnosis, Management and Treatment*. Chapter 1, pag. 7. Edited by Nutt D., Davidson J.R.T., Zohar J., UK.
- Durham T.W., McCammon S. & Allison E.J.J. (1985) The psychological impact of disaster on rescue personnel. *Annals of Emergency Medicine*, 14:664-668.
- Ehlers A., Mayou R.A., Bryant B. (1998) Psychological predictors of chronic posttraumatic stress disorder after motor vehicle accidents. *J Abnorm Psychol*, Aug;107(3):508-19
- Epstein R.S., Fullerton C.S., Ursano R.J. (1998). Posttraumatic stress disorder following an air disaster: a prospective study. *Am J Psychiatry*, Jul 155(7):934-8.
- Freddy J.R., Shaw D.L., Jarrell M.P., Master C.R. (1992) Towards an understanding of the psychological impact of natural disasters: an application of the conservation of resources stress model. *J Traumatic Stress* 5, 441-454.
- Freddy J.R., Shaw D.L., Jarrell M.P., Master C.R. (1992) Towards an understanding of the psychological impact of natural disasters: an application of the conservation of resources stress model. *J Traumatic Stress* 5: 441-454.
- Freedmen S.A., Peri T., Brandes D., Shalev A.Y. (1999). Predictors of chronic PTSD a prospective study. *Br J Psychiatry* 174, 353-9.
- Garrison C.Z., Bryant E.S., Addy C.L., Spurrier P.G., Freedy J.R., Kilpatrick D.G. (1995). Posttraumatic stress disorder in adolescents after Hurricane Andrew. *J Am Acad Child Adolesc Psychiatry*, Sep 34(9):1193-201.
- Gersons B. Patterns of PTSD among police officers following a shooting incident: a two dimensional model and treatment implications. (1989) *J Trauma Stress* 2:247-57.
- Goenjian A.K., Najarian L.M., Pynoos R.S., Steinberg A.M., Manoukian G., Tavosian A., Fairbanks L.A. (1994). Posttraumatic stress disorder in elderly and younger adults after the 1988 earthquake in Armenia. *Am J Psychiatry*, Jun;151(6):895-901.
- Goldberg D.P. (1972) The Detection of psychiatric illness by Questionnaire. Oxford University Press, London..
- Green B.L., Lindy J.D., Grace M.C., Leonard A.C. (1992). Chronic posttraumatic stress disorder and diagnostic comorbidity in a disaster sample. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, Dec;180(12):760-6.
- Gregg W., Medley I., Fowler-Dixon R., Curran P., Loughrey G., Bell P., Lee A., Harrison G. (1995). Psychological consequences of the Kegworth air disaster. *Br J Psychiatry*, Dec 167(6):812-7. Erratum in: *Br J Psychiatry* 1996 Feb;168(2):254.
- Hodgkinson P.E., Stewart M. (1988) Coping with catastrophe. A handbook of post-disaster psychosocial aftercare. London: Routledge.
- Horowitz M., Wilner N. & Alvarez W. (1979) Impact of Event Scale: A measure of subjective stress. *Psychosomatic Medicine* 41:209-218.
- James & Wright (1991) Occupational stress in the ambulance services. *Health Manpower Management* 17: 4-11.
- Jonsson A., Segesten K., Mattsson B. (2003). Post-traumatic stress among Swedish ambulance personnel. *Emerg Med J*, Jan;20(1):79-84.
- Kessler R.C., Sonnega A., Bromet E., Hughes M., Nelson C.B. (1995) Posttraumatic stress disorder in the National Comorbidity Survey. *Arch Gen Psychiatry*, Dec 52(12):1048-60.

- Kulka R.A., Schlenger W.E., Fairbank J.A. (1990) Trauma and the Vietnam War Generation: Report of Findings from the National Vietnam Veterans Readjustment Study, Brunner/Mazel: New York.
- Lima B.R., Pai S., Santacruz H., Lozano J. (1991). Psychiatric disorders among poor victims following a major disaster: Armero, Colombia. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, Jul 179(7):420-7.
- Lima B.R., Pai S., Toledo V., Caris L., Haro J.M., Lozano J., Santacruz H. (1993). Emotional distress in disaster victims. A follow-up study. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, Jun 181(6):388-93.
- Madakasira S., O'Brien K.F. (1987). Acute posttraumatic stress disorder in victims of a natural disaster. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, May 175(5):286-90.
- Maj M., Starace F., Crepet P., Loblance S., De Marco F., Kemali D. (1989) Prevalence of psychiatric disorders among subjects exposed to a natural disaster. *Acta Psychiatr Scand* 179, 544-549.
- Mantero M., Gozzini C., Gambarini C., Fumagalli S., Crippa L., Penati G. (2001) Clinical and biological aspects of Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). *The Italian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioural Sciences*, vol. 11; No. 1, Settembre.
- Marmar C., Weiss D., Metzler T., Delucchi K., Best S., Wentworth K. (1999) Longitudinal course and predictors of continuing distress following critical incident exposure in emergency service personnel. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, 187:15-22.
- Marmar C.R., Weiss D.S., Metzler T.J., Ronfeldt H.M., Foreman C. (1996) Stress responses of emergency services personnel to the Loma Prieta earthquake Interstate 880 freeway collapse and control traumatic incidents. *J Trauma Stress*, Jan 9(1):63-85.
- Mayou R., Bryant B., Duthie R. (1993) Psychiatric consequences of road traffic accidents. *BMJ*, Sep 11, 307(6905):647-51.
- McCammon S., Durham T., Allison E. & Williamson J.E. (1988) Emergency workers' cognitive appraisal and coping with traumatic events. *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 1: 353-372.
- McCarroll J.E., Ursano R.J., Fullerton C.S. (1993). Symptoms of posttraumatic stress disorder following recovery of war dead. *Am J Psychiatry*, Dec; 150(12):1875-7.
- McFarlane A.C., Clayer J.R., Bookless C.L. (1997) Psychiatric morbidity following a natural disaster: an Australian bushfire. *Soc Psychiatry Psychiatr Epidemiol*, Jul 32(5):261-8.
- McFarlane A.C. (1988a) The aetiology of post-traumatic stress disorders following a natural disaster. *Br J Psychiatry*, Jan; 152:116-21.
- McFarlane A.C. (1988b) The longitudinal course of posttraumatic morbidity. The range of outcomes and their predictors. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, Jan 176(1):30-9.
- Meltzer-Brody S., Connor K.M., Churchill E., Davidson J.R. (2000). Symptom-specific effects of fluoxetine in post-traumatic stress disorder. *Int Clin Psychopharmacol*, Jul 15(4):227-31.
- Miller R.J., Sutherland A.G., Hutchison J.D., Alexander D.A. (2001) C-reactive protein and interleukin 6 receptor in post-traumatic stress disorder: a pilot study. *Cytokine*, Feb 21; 13(4):253-5.
- Perkonig A., Kessler R.C., Storz S., Wittchen H.U. (2000) Traumatic events and post-traumatic stress disorder in the community: prevalence, risk factors and comorbidity. *Acta Psychiatr Scand*, Jan 101(1):46-59.
- Renck B., Weisaeth L., Skarbo S. (2002) Stress reactions in police officers after a disaster rescue operation. *Nord J Psychiatry* 56(1):7-14.
- Rentoul R. & Ravenscroft T. (1993) Managing post traumatic stress in the emergency services. *Disaster Management* 5: 199-201.
- Resnick H.S., Kilpatrick D.G., Dansky B.S., Saunders B.E., Best C.L. (1993) Prevalence of civilian trauma and posttraumatic stress disorder in a representative national sample of women. *J Consult Clin Psychol*, Dec 61(6):984-91.
- Robinson H.M., Sigman M.R., Wilson J.P. (1997). Duty-related stressors and PTSD symptoms in suburban police officers. *Psychol Rep*, Dec 81(3 Pt 1):835-45.
- Rubonis A.V., Bickman L. (1991). Psychological impairment in the wake of disaster-psychopathology relationship. *Psychol Bull* 109, 384-399.
- Shalev A.Y., Freedman S., Brandes D. (1997) Predicting PTSD in civilian trauma survivors: Prospective evaluation of self report and civilian administered instruments. *Br J Psychiatry* 170, 558-64.
- Sharan P., Chaudhary G., Kavathekar S.A., Saxena S. (1996) Preliminary report of psychiatric disorders in survivors of a severe earthquake. *Am J Psychiatry*, Apr 153(4):556-8.
- Shepherd M., & Hodgkinson P.E. (1990) The hidden victims of disaster: Helper stress. *Stress Medicine*. 6: 29-35.
- Shore J.H., Tatum E.L., Vollmer W.M. (1986) Psychiatric reactions to disaster: the Mount St. Helens experience. *Am J Psychiatry*, May; 143(5):590-5.
- Siegel S., Castellan N.J. Jr. (1988) Nonparametric statistics for the behavioral sciences. New York: McGraw Hill Book Company, pp. 213-214.
- Sloan I.H., Rozensky R.H., Kaplan L., Saunders S.M. (1994) A shooting incident in an elementary school: effects of worker stress on public safety, mental health, and medical personnel. *J Trauma Stress*, Oct 7(4):565-74.
- Solomon R., Horn J. (1986) Post shooting trauma reactions: a pilot study. In: Reece J, Goldstein H, Editors. *Psychological services for law enforcement*. Washington (DC): United States Government Printing Office, p.383-93
- Solomon S.D., Davidson J.R. (1997). Trauma: prevalence, impairment, service use, and cost. *J Clin Psychiatry* 58 Suppl 9:5-11. Review.
- Stein M.B., Walker J.R., Hazen A.L., Forde D.R. (1997) Full and partial posttraumatic stress disorder: findings from a community survey. *Am J Psychiatry*, Aug 154(8):1114-9.
- Steinglass P., Gerrity E.T. (1990) Natural disaster and posttraumatic stress disorder: short-term versus long-term recovery in two disaster-affected communities. *J Appl Soc Psychol*, 21:1746-1765.
- Sutker P.B., Uddo M., Brailey K., Allain A.N., Errera P. (1994a) Psychological symptoms and psychiatric diagnoses in Operation Desert Storm troops serving Graves registration duty. *J Trauma Stress*, Apr 7(2):159-71.
- Sutker P.B., Uddo M., Brailey K., Vasterling J.J., Errera P. (1994b). Psychopathology in war-zone deployed and nondeployed Operation Desert Storm troops assigned graves registration duties. *J Abnorm Psychol*, May 103(2):383-90.
- Taylor A.J., Frazer A.G. (1982) The stress of post-disaster body handling and victim identification work. *J Human Stress*, Dec 8(4):4-12.
- Thompson J & Suzuki I. Stress in ambulance workers. *Disaster management*. 1991; 3:193-197.
- Ursano R.J., Fullerton C.S., Kao T.C., Bhartiya V.R. (1995). Longitudinal assessment of posttraumatic stress disorder and depression after exposure to traumatic death. *J Nerv Ment Dis*, Jan 183(1):36-42.
- Ursano R.J., Fullerton C.S., Vance K., Kao T.C. (1999). Posttraumatic stress disorder and identification in disaster workers. *Am J Psychiatry*, Mar 156(3):353-9.
- Van Dyke C., Zilberg N.J., McKinnon J.A. (1985). Posttraumatic stress disorder: a thirty-year delay in a World War II veteran. *Am J Psychiatry*, Sep 142(9):1070-3.
- Wang X., Gao L., Shinfuku N., Zhang H., Zhao C., Shen Y. (2000) Longitudinal study of earthquake-related PTSD in a randomly selected community sample in north China. *Am J Psychiatry*, Aug 157(8):1260-6.
- Weiss D., Marmar C., Metzler T., Ronfeldt H. (1995) Predicting symptomatic distress in emergency services personnel. *J Consult Clin Psychol* 63:361-8.
- Wells J.E., Williams T.H., Macleod A.D., Carroll G.J. (2003) Posttraumatic stress disorder: do electrical startle responses and thyroid function usefully supplement self-report? A study of Vietnam War veterans. *Aust N Z J Psychiatry*, Jun 37(3):334-9.